

Book Reviews

RICHARD III. A STUDY OF SERVICE. Rosemary Horrox. 1989. Cambridge University Press, £30.

Dr. Horrox's work is already well known to students of the Yorkist period in general and of Richard III's reign in particular, but in this outstanding new book she has put scholars even deeper into her debt. Surveying both the printed evidence and a wealth of manuscript material, scattered in repositories from Cumbria to Kent and Cornwall, she has built up a picture of social ties and obligations from a mosaic of tiny fragments into an intelligible whole. Indeed, quite apart from the relevance of these connections to our understanding of the politics of the period, which is the core of the work, the book provides an admirable study of patronage and its implications in the age of bastard feudalism. It is essentially a book for specialists — the general reader might easily lose the way in the mass of detail, although local historians could profitably pursue references to families of interest in their own particular areas.

After an Introduction examining the nature of service in fifteenth century society, the book is divided into six chapters, five of which deal with clear chronological divisions in Richard's career, the creation of a Gloucester affinity before 1483 (particularly, although not exclusively, in the north), the reign of Edward V and the Usurpation, the rebellion in the autumn of 1483, the subsequent restoration of royal authority, and the collapse of the Ricardian regime before Bosworth. The remaining chapter examines the nature and composition of the royal household and the wider effects which this had on political society, not only under Richard but also with glances before and after to the reigns of Edward IV and Henry VII.

The examination of Richard's connection confirms the view that in many ways his power base lay in the north, and that his reliance on northerners proved in the long term to be a weakness as well as a strength. It becomes clear, however, that the infiltration of northerners into positions of influence in the south was gradual and must be set in a proper chronological context. The origins of the authority which Richard exercised as Duke of Gloucester derived above all from his brother's support, which enabled him to take over the old Neville retainers and secure indirect influence over the Percy connection, two of the most significant power blocs in northern society. It was not, however, until after the rebellion in late 1483 that one sees the infiltration of Richard's northern followers into lands and offices in the south — during the period of the Protectorate and immediately after the Usurpation he was still able to rely on support from the old household affinity of Edward IV. It was the participation of many of the latter in the rebellion of late 1483 that was the turning-point in Richard's exercise of patronage. He turned to his own old retainers from the Gloucester ducal affinity, in whom he had greater confidence, even excluding from positions of power old servants of Edward IV who had not taken part in

the rising. In the long run, this probably created further problems for the new King — not only did the forfeitures of the 1484 Parliament create a feeling of instability in political society, but the favour extended to outsiders served to contract even further the circle of potential loyalists in the south. The King's ultimate failure lay in his inability to win over the uncommitted, with the result that his supporters at Bosworth came primarily from those who had backed the Usurpation two years earlier. By contrast, the nucleus of Henry Tudor's party comprised those who had been excluded from power.

The operations of the patronage system are also demonstrated in the career of Buckingham. As Richard's principal supporter (though not one of his associates before Edward IV's death), he gained power particularly in areas of earlier Woodville influence. The motives for his revolt and his subsequent fall still, however, pose problems, although the failure to attract support from lesser men was clearly a major factor in the rebellion's collapse. Dr. Horrox is too wise a historian to be dogmatic on why Buckingham rebelled, although there are considerable attractions in her suggestion that he was prompted more by a desire to end up on the winning side, when discontent with Richard was already appearing, than by any attempt to advance his own interests even further.

She displays similar scholarly caution in treating another of the enigmas of 1483, the reasons for the execution of Hastings. Her assessment of the evidence is perceptive, though more perhaps might have been made of the unanimity of the sources in suggesting that Hastings was taken completely unawares by Richard's allegations of treason on 13 June, something surely incompatible with either his participation in a hypothetical Woodville plot or an awareness of the Protector having ambitions for the throne. Hastings was not politically naive — had he been so, he could hardly have survived the political turmoil of the previous two decades. The very fact, however, that Dr. Horrox does not claim to have solved all the problems of the reign is reassuring to those of us who have struggled with them in the past and felt them so often to be insoluble. What she has done, and done supremely well, is to demonstrate the complexity of late Yorkist political society and to point to ways in which it can be illuminated.

J. A. F. THOMSON

TWELVE GOOD MEN AND TRUE: THE CRIMINAL TRIAL JURY IN ENGLAND 1200-1800. Edited by J. S. Cockburn and Thomas A. Green. 1988. Princeton University Press, Princeton, New Jersey, \$44.

The ten essays — with an over-view by Thomas A. Green — that make up this fine book are a goldmine on the creation, establishment and development of the criminal jury system in England in the 600 years between 1200 and 1800. Alas that the reader like the miner has to dig so long and so deep for all the nuggets it contains.

Academic writers are rarely identified by the pellucidity of their prose. It seems the more arcane the subject matter the more easily justified feels the

author in submerging it in obfuscation. Objectives are set which appear designed to dilute any spirit of enquiry in the reader and to diminish his sense of anticipation and adventure, and language is employed which bewilders and eventually stupefies the mind. In such circumstances, meticulous research and painstaking examination of alternative theses become mere squandered time, pedantic and tiresome.

There is enough of this here to irritate. But not enough to destroy the remarkable contribution each essay makes to the study of the evolution of the jury. I single out two: Roger Groot on the early thirteenth century jury, in which he claims to identify the first men hanged as the result of a jury verdict (in York of course), and Stephen Roberts on juries in Devon Quarter Sessions over a period of twenty years in the seventeenth century: a study as he calls it in the 'middling sort of man'. Both are compulsive reading. Not only do they maintain the high level of original research which distinguishes the book as a whole, but they carry a breadth of vision too, though even they are best read in the study: this is no book for light reading before the crackling log fire on Sunday afternoons.

The book inevitably lacks continuity. Each author has chosen his own period and has his own perspective. So Roberts writes: 'Historians of the jury divide quite neatly into those who see it as enjoying wide initiative in government and fact-finding and those who see little evidence of jury independence', oblivious of the fact that twenty pages earlier Professor Cockburn demonstrates over a 120 year period (which happens to include the trials of 'Freeborn' Jack Lilburne and Penn and Mead) a constant acquittal rate which shows the division to be a fly-blown myth. This assertion requires justification.

Cockburn has made a meticulous examination of the verdicts of Kent juries in property crime cases between 1560 and 1670. The acquittal rate here never fell below 29% in any ten year period within those years, and in three periods was above 40%. In the final twenty years when five men, as he puts it, 'virtually monopolized the office of foreman', becoming in reality professional jurors, the acquittal rate was 38.9 and 40.9%. Yet these jurors were as 'male, middle-aged, middle-minded and middle-class' as the jurors of whom Lord Devlin wrote in 1956. They had an in-built inclination to protect their own, particularly their own property, an inclination shared with the judges and covertly, often less than covertly, encouraged in summing-up cases where property was alleged to be stolen or damaged. The message from the judge would be plainly read: acquit this miscreant and your own property will not be safe. Making proper allowance for the inefficiencies of the criminal process and the inevitable prejudices of the criminal trial, these figures do not support any claim to a lack of independence in the ordinary jury sworn in the ordinary criminal trial. On the contrary, the figures closely mirror those returned in south-east England to-day.

Professor Green's final 'retrospective' on this colossal canvas of six centuries fails to give cohesion to the book. I do not think the attempt was worth the effort. Far better that he attacked the scandal of its publication in the United States. As a result, like Leonard Levy's *Origins of the Fifth Amendment*, *The Right against Self-Incrimination*, and his own *Verdict according to Conscience*, this book can be found in the library of Congress and not in the

library of the House of Commons or the four Inns of Court. So little do we value our finest institutions. Members of the Selden Society will be wringing their hands in mortification.

RICHARD DU CANN

THE MEDIEVAL ENGLISH UNIVERSITIES: OXFORD AND CAMBRIDGE TO c.1500. Alan B. Cobban. 1988. Scolar Press, Cambridge, £30.

This long awaited, well researched book is greatly to be welcomed. It is produced to the customary high standards of the Scolar Press: in itself a reminder of how books used to be, and a pleasure to consult and handle. The quality of the reproduction of the plates leaves something to be desired: but the illustrations themselves are an added bonus. They contain much that is new and unexpected, including a memorable picture of the porter of New College, Oxford, ejecting a student who was not a College member. The book itself does not always make easy reading. The two preliminary chapters, setting the English universities within their European context, and delineating the historical framework of the establishment and early growth of Oxford and Cambridge, are particularly heavy going. This is a pity, because the author has much of value to say, especially on the foundation and antiquity of Cambridge which emerges here in a way far more interesting than in the proto-Arthurian legends with which the middle ages enshrouded it. Dr. Cobban rather shirks the task of evaluating Professor Southern's recent and exciting (but controversial) study of Robert Grosseteste and his role in the developing university of Oxford (the book may have appeared too late for full incorporation): although passing references seem to signify disagreement. He does, however, offer a convincing and much needed corrective to Hastings Rashdall's still indispensable work. Both universities here increase in stature in a European context, and Cambridge acquires a status and authority of her own.

As Dr. Cobban moves on to discuss the government and organisation of the universities, and the shifting balance between democratic government through the regent system, central teaching, and student residence in hall, and the smaller, more exclusive and oligarchic collegiate practice and decentralisation of teaching that was to dominate from the Renaissance period, the book springs to life. There is perhaps a little too much emphasis on King's Hall, Cambridge, the subject of a major study by the same author; but the range of learning and research shown is large and unassumingly carried. Dr. Cobban concerns himself with the intellectual life of the university as well as its infrastructure; with the relations between town and gown, and with the royal administration. Inevitably, Dr. Cobban follows the evidence in concentrating on the higher faculties: but the undergraduates, most of whom studied arts, are not neglected. A minute acquaintance with college statutes and accounts gives rise to two highly readable chapters on the academic community and student

life. Laundresses prove to be one of the highest paid classes of college servants; prostitution and gaming were, unsurprisingly, recurrent problems.

A rather impenetrable but important chapter discusses changing fashions in academic studies. Using a computer based methodology, he shows how the study of the two laws became increasingly popular: in contravention, in some instances, to the statutes laid down by founders of individual colleges. At Cambridge, in contrast to Oxford, there was a conscious attempt to reverse this trend and, for a short period, theology was the preferred discipline followed by particular colleges. The essay includes some surprising nuggets. For example, Henry VI may have favoured bishops whose degree was in theology but he, or perhaps his advisers, provided King's Hall with its largest single bequest of books relating to studies in the civil law. The development of Oxford in the fifteenth century is seen to have suffered — in terms of foundations, privileges, and even intellectual vitality — by the association of some elements in the university with the Wycliffite heresy.

The late fifteenth century saw the emergence of the non-resident chancellor: the first such being none other than George Neville, brother of the Kingmaker. Although the externalisation of the chancellorship opened up exciting opportunities, it also opened the universities to increasing political pressures, a stratagem that the Tudors were not slow to exploit. The point is well made, and the implications for the universities brought out. The fifteenth century also provides the most precise evidence of the existence (often ephemeral) of student halls, the principal residences open to undergraduates. The list here used is that of John Rous, the antiquary whose genealogy of the earls of Warwick is so familiar to the student of the reign of Richard III. Richard's visit to Oxford in July 1483 provides an interesting insight into one of the least chronicled but vital aspects of intellectual life in college, the holding of the college disputation. It also, coincidentally, surely encourages the current philosophy of the Richard III Society in making available to a wider public certain of its publications: a footnote acknowledges the debt. In all, this is a rich and well ordered book, which will repay re-reading.

There are two minor cavils. A well thought out and well structured book (as this is) does not require link passages between each chapter — they serve only to annoy. The conclusion is not a drawing together, but a recapitulation of the main points of each chapter. This is a slight anti-climax: although the arrangement will no doubt suit the lazy student or the hurried reader as a substitute for reading the whole book. He will miss much. By contrast, the rather old fashioned employment of subheads in the list of contents will greatly facilitate rapid reference and subsequent use of the book and is, in context, much to be recommended. The index is a curiosity: 'business ("useful") studies', and 'aristocracy see nobility' give the general flavour. An exhaustive bibliography, however, neatly completes and complements the usefulness of this magisterial work.

MARGARET CONDON

THE MEDIEVAL MACHINE: THE INDUSTRIAL REVOLUTION OF THE MIDDLE AGES. Jean Gimpel. Revised Second Edition 1988. Wildwood House Ltd., Aldershot, Hants., £14.95.

This lively and wide-ranging book attempts to redress the popular view that the middle ages, because 'medieval' were backward. In fact, Jean Gimpel argues that, far from being technologically limited and inert, the thousand-year interval which separated the classical from the renaissance world was 'a dynamic and progressive period when inventions were at a premium' and important advances were made in agriculture, mining, manufacturing, architecture, and scientific thought. Key medieval innovations to which he pays particular attention include the wider application of water power and associated harnessing of windpower, substitution of horses for oxen in haulage and traction, development of the heavy wheeled-plough, more widespread prospecting for, and mining of, gold, silver, lead, and coal, and invention of the mechanical clock. He is, however, as much concerned with the spirit of the age as with the technology which it produced and towards that end examines developments in scientific thought and knowledge and the influence of changing social and religious attitudes upon technical and scientific progress. Along the way, in a text which is consistently readable and liberally laced with fascinating anecdotes, we are treated to accounts of individuals as diverse as the English agronomist, Walter of Henley; Richard of Wallingford, Abbot of St Albans and creator of an important early astronomical clock; the notable French architect and engineer, Villard de Honnecourt (upon whom Gimpel is an authority); and Roger Bacon, the Oxford-based mathematician and scientist.

Within this overall time-span Gimpel identifies the period from c.1050 to c.1265 as especially enlightened and progressive, its self-confident, enterprising, and crusading spirit promoting important achievements in science and technology which presaged, in several instances, later, post-medieval developments. The fourteenth and fifteenth centuries, by contrast, witnessed declining 'psychological drive' and a slackening pace of technological innovation, with such technical improvements as were made — such as the invention in 1405 of the culverin, the first artillery weapon with portable ammunition — benefiting the instruments of war more than those of peace. In an extended and provocative epilogue, which is the book's most original feature, he goes on to explore the parallels which can be drawn between the economic depression that struck Europe in the fourteenth century and the signs of economic malaise which are so apparent within the West today, and on that basis offers the gloomy prognosis that 'the depression we have moved into will have no end'. Fortunately, the same was not true of the fifteenth century, but of the remarkable economic and technological recovery which began to affect Europe towards the end of that century, Gimpel has little to say; except to observe that it was much less of a new departure than the scientists and philosophers of the Renaissance believed it to have been.

Gimpel is thus a champion of that earlier Renaissance of the twelfth and early thirteenth centuries and he defends his cause with all the partisanship that one might expect of a former French resistance fighter. Unfortunately, the

result, although compelling, is not entirely convincing. Too many of the claims that he makes of the benefits of particular technological advances are overstated and fail to take account of research which has been undertaken since the first edition of 1976. For instance, J. L. Langdon has questioned the supposed link between the more widespread use of horses in agriculture and significant gains in productivity; R. Holt has demonstrated that in England at least, with the exception of fulling, the application of water power to industrial processes remained extremely limited for much of the middle ages; and H. S. A. Fox has shown that there is little direct evidence of a widespread changeover from two- to three-field systems during the twelfth and thirteenth centuries. Medieval technology undoubtedly underwent important changes during these two centuries but these were hardly of a pace or of an order to constitute an 'industrial revolution', at least insofar as this was reflected by any corresponding rise in productivity. Such a rise certainly occurred within the medieval economy, but work by Persson and Skott indicates that it was of a relatively low order and it is probable that, as in many contemporary underdeveloped countries, the population grew even faster. The rising living standards which Gimpel associates with this period therefore pertained only to those who controlled the means of production, notably landlords and merchant capitalists; whereas living standards of a majority of the population inevitably fell. Nor is it likely that any other outcome was possible under medieval socio-economic conditions.

The great expansion of the early middle ages took place within a context of feudal labour and property relations and these ultimately constrained the capacity of the economy to grow. Not until these relations had been dissolved could the full potential for economic growth via the application of capital to new technology be realised, and it was this, rather than technological progress *per se*, that in much of north-west Europe was the singular achievement of the later middle ages. Structural reform during the fourteenth and, more especially, the fifteenth centuries therefore prepared the way for progress to come, as it may yet do in the West today. If a contemporary lesson is thus to be drawn from the experience of the later middle ages it is, perhaps, that there are more grounds for optimism than Gimpel will allow.

BRUCE M. S. CAMPBELL

M. Gimpel says that he is always interested to hear from anyone who has found new details of any invention of the middle ages. The Editor.

CAXTON: THE DESCRIPTION OF BRITAIN. A MODERN RENDERING. Marie Collins. 1988. Sidgwick and Jackson, London, £14.95.

Caxton introduces *the discripcion of Britayne*, the printing of which was completed on 18 August 1480, as 'the discripcōn of this said Ile of Britayne with the commoditees of the same', and in the colophon reveals that its substance was 'taken oute of Policronicon according to the translacion of Treuisa'. It

consists in fact of selections made by the printer from the first book of John Trevisa's late fourteenth-century anglicization of Ranulph Higden's earlier Latin universal chronicle, compiled at St. Werburgh's, Chester. As the numbers of surviving manuscripts testify, both the Latin and English versions of the *Polychronicon* were well known in the fifteenth century, and Caxton's decision to produce a series of extracts probably in part represented an attempt to test the market for the complete text of Trevisa's translation which he was to print in 1482. At the same time, the short book was calculated to make a uniquely nationalistic appeal, lifting and re-arranging as it does from one lengthy section on 'Mappa mundi' the specific parts of the *Polychronicon* which deal with England, Wales, Scotland, and Ireland. Marie Collins's 'modern rendering' of this text presents to twentieth-century general readers a taste of late medieval understanding of British history and topography, enriched by copious photographs and illustrations.

The text itself is prefaced by a selective chronology which sets the major events mentioned in the contexts of both British and world history, and by an historical introduction, supplied by Virginia Davis. This prepares the non-specialist reader for some of the more alien features of medieval historiography, supplies brief biographies of Higden and Trevisa, and suggests that Caxton's enterprise in compiling the *discripcion* combines the tenacity of medieval traditions of viewing the past with the beginnings of renaissance national antiquarianism. Further notes are provided on the historical sources cited by Higden (references to which are retained in Caxton's compilation), and these usefully summarize the individual motives and perspectives of writers such as Geoffrey of Monmouth or Gerald of Wales. A short and up-to-date list of books recommended as further reading cites modern translations of several of these sources, and specialized works on medieval historical writing, but oddly omits any mention of Churchill Babington's edition of the Latin and English texts of the *Polychronicon* for the Rolls Series, or of works dealing with Caxton's career and writings.

Some attention is admittedly paid to these in the editor's own introduction, which stresses Caxton's business acumen and sense of 'what the public wanted', and amplifies the preceding sketch of the genesis of the *discripcion*, reminding readers that medieval writers were often compilers rather than 'original' authors. The remainder of this section is devoted to an explanation of the principles which underly this new rendering of the material — an undertaking which, as the editor implies, the modernizing Caxton himself would probably have applauded. Collins's policy has been 'in effect to rewrite the *Description* to be readily comprehensible to a twentieth-century audience . . . making decisions about interpretation and occasional silent expansion which cannot be discussed in detail in a book of this kind'; 'small amounts of explanatory material' have been added when necessary. The reader interested in pursuing questions arising from the translation is referred rather vaguely to 'the Rolls Series' (with no bibliographical information); even for the most general audience some direction to the Pollard and Redgrave *Short-Title Catalogue* entry for the *discripcion* (13440a), where locations of surviving copies are listed, might have been proper, in view of the fact that the Rolls Series edition contains Caxton's text only as re-

absorbed into his full 1482 version of the complete *Polychronicon* — and even this only in the form of a corpus of variants.

The modernization reads well, clearly paragraphed and punctuated, and has been executed with a subtle ear for the witticisms or acerbities derived from their sources by the three successive medieval redactors (the habits of the Irish, for example, perhaps partly to be explained by the 'defawtes' of the land, drew from them particularly imaginative comment). The 'rendering' amounts virtually to translation, terse but accurate, with appropriate modern equivalents substituted for Caxton's idioms. Editorial insertions generally concern the form in which the historical sources are cited. Higden himself, after a long list of his authorities in one of the early chapters of the *Polychronicon*, included in his text abbreviated references to the source of each borrowing, and prefaced his own insertions with the initial 'R'. Trevisa's and Caxton's versions retained this system of referencing. Collins expands the abbreviated names ('R' becomes 'Ranulph'), deletes the references to book and chapter numbers (these sometimes warrant a mention in the textual notes), and sews the annotation into the continuous prose of her text by means of locutions such as 'Ranulph, whom I follow, at this point declares his intention to give a brief account of the seven kingdoms mentioned previously' (p.82), for which Caxton's version reads 'R of the forsaid vij kyngdomes'. Some ingenuity is expended on varying these expansions ('According to Ranulph', p.38; 'Ranulph reports', p.49; 'Ranulph observes', p.56), and also on the problems occasioned by Trevisa's interpolation of his own commentary (e.g. p.112). Other insertions gloss obscurities of various kinds: a Welsh proverb (p.51), or a 'poet', anonymous in Caxton's version, who is identified as 'the Roman satirist, Juvenal' (p.134). Brief notes at the end of the text serve further explanatory purposes, and allow for some cross-referencing; there is some duplication between the notes on sources which are supplied here and the material included in the historical introduction.

The numerous accompanying photographs and illustrations constitute a major attraction, and their appeal may indeed for some readers surpass the interest of the text. They include modern and medieval maps; more-or-less relevant illustrations from a wide variety of artefacts, and a wealth of sumptuous photographs of parts of Britain to which the *Description* refers. Some stretching of the definition of 'medieval' has been necessary to justify inclusion of the map on p.122 and the illustration depicting beekeeping on page 150, and the famous scene of pilgrims on horseback reproduced on page 63 (from British Library MS Royal 18.D.ii; it has recently also been used on the cover of the paperback *Riverside Chaucer*) is surely from Lydgate's *Siege of Thebes* rather than from his *Troy-Book*, as the caption would have it. I found it irritating that no tables of maps or plates are provided, and that the captions give no precise information about the sources of the illustrations (the concluding acknowledgements offer a little help here, but only of a vague kind). Nonetheless, the quality of the reproductions is good, and the illustrations notably enrich this attractive and well-produced book. (I noticed only two proof-reading oversights: page 13, line 7 requires a comma rather than a full stop; on page 172, note 3 to chapter 15 should refer to the 'Early English Text Society').

The reservations I express in this review derive almost wholly from my

uncertainty about the nature of the market at which the book is aimed. The tenor of its introductory material suggests an expected audience of non-scholarly readers for whom the book's appeal might lie in its pictures, its quirky informativeness, and its humour (it is conceivably funny to discover that the Welsh taste for leeks has endured over five hundred years). For such an audience, though, the text is surely full of *longueurs*: chapters on 'Bishoprics and Sees' or 'Laws and their Names' contain little that is diverting. Furthermore, the translation and annotation might in this context prove occasionally perplexing: to read about minim-strokes, or that in Wales 'There is also a marvellous rock called "the rock of hearing", named on the *lucus a non lucendo* principle' (Caxton names it 'The roche of hering by contrey'), may merely baffle. On the other hand, historians, and students of literature and of early printing, will be irritated by the radical modernization of the text, the book's paucity of bibliographical guidance, and by its silence on particular matters of significance. It would be interesting to learn more about the principles which guided Caxton's selection and arrangement of extracts, for instance, or to have some discussion of the fact that his section on Wales is in verse rather than prose (something not mentioned here at all). But while it is frustrating that the obvious care and energy which the editor and her collaborators have put into their research should be partly concealed by the nature of the end product, the team has nonetheless produced a sound and appealing book. It must constitute the classiest possible British souvenir.

JULIA BOFFEY

THE MIROUR OF MANS SALVACIOUNE. A MIDDLE ENGLISH TRANSLATION OF *SPECULUM HUMANAЕ SALVATIONIS*. A critical edition of the fifteenth-century manuscript illustrated from *Der Spiegel der menschen Behältnis*, Speyer: Drach, c.1475. Avril Henry. 1986. Scholar Press, Aldershot, £35.

The Mirour of Man's Salvacioune is an early fifteenth-century Middle English verse translation of the *Speculum humanae salvationis*, an immensely popular late medieval devotional text, compiled probably in Germany or Austria where it was widely circulated, possibly in Italy, in the first quarter of the fourteenth century. Over 380 manuscript and blockbook copies of the fourteenth and fifteenth century are known, an exceptional number for this type of text. Most are in the Latin couplet original version, but besides the early German translations, there are French, Dutch and Czech as well as English versions. In the fifteenth century, the French translation by Jean Miélot, 1448, made for Philip the Good, gained new currency, and was copied in de luxe manuscripts for Philip the Good himself and for Louis of Gruuthuse.

The popularity of the *Speculum* to about A.D. 1500 seems to have derived both from its contents and from the illustrations added to almost a third of the extant copies, although relatively few are of high quality. The text consists of forty-five chapters, preceded by a prologue and summary of contents, narrating

world history from the Fall of Lucifer to the Last Judgment. Chapters 3 to 42 present a leading event from the New Testament (antitype), prefigured by three events from the Old Testament or the apocrypha (type). The life of the Virgin receives almost as much emphasis as the life of Christ, and the final three chapters are on the Passion, the Sorrows and the Joys of the Virgin. All but the last three chapters are 100 lines long, arranged in most illustrated copies on a double opening in columns of twenty-five lines, two to the page, each column headed by a miniature, so that the relationship of type and antitype can be taken in at a glance. In a full set of illustrations, there are 192 miniatures.

In contrast, the manuscript edited by Avril Henry, the only known text of the Middle English version, is a modest copy, entirely without illustration. As a modern critical edition of a unique manuscript and one which remains in private hands (in the Foyle collection), it is very welcome. The manuscript was previously edited in 1888 by Alfred Huth, then the owner, for the Roxburghe Club. The Huth edition is attractive to use and contains a good facsimile reproduction of one page, but was limited to seventy-five copies, and has some peculiarities, including a passage of 'Middle English' invented by Huth to supply the lacuna in the manuscript in Chapters 17 and 18. Avril Henry has retranslated the missing text from Latin into modern English to supply this gap, and also translated in an appendix the author's comments on his prohemium and prologue, not found in the Middle English. The apparatus is straightforward to use and the introduction includes a clear explanation of editorial practice as well as a study of the contents of the *Speculum* text, which benefits from Avril Henry's interest in typological works. The full Glossary will enhance the value of this edition as a reference book. The scribbled notes of two sixteenth-century annotators have been carefully transcribed. It is of considerable interest that the manuscript was still read by a parish clerk, Thomas Cowper, as late as 1570.

On the other hand, two aspects of this edition are much less satisfactory. The design of the book is mediocre. This is not merely an aesthetic complaint. For example, the type-size of the introduction is too small for easy reading and the quality of the two reproductions from the manuscript unacceptably poor. It was an uncomfortable decision to illustrate an unillustrated manuscript, which dates from the second quarter of the fifteenth century, with a selection of woodcuts from a microfilm of *Der Spiegel der menschen Behältinis*, printed at Speyer c.1475. The cover illustration of the parable of the felled oak from the prologue is inexplicably from Bibliothèque Nationale manuscript of Miélot's translation edited by Lutz and Perdrizet, a de luxe French copy of the third quarter of the fifteenth century. Readers interested in the illustrative and iconographic tradition will want to return to the considerable body of existing work, from Lutz and Perdrizet (1907-1909), to Evelyn Silber (1982), and to the recent anthology of A. and J. L. Wilson (1985). Avril Henry's full bibliography provides a guide to most of the relevant literature on all aspects of the *Speculum*, but given her glances at the incunabular tradition, it is surprising to find no reference to the pioneering work of Wytze and Lotte Hellinga.

JENNY STRATFORD

THE DEVIL AT ISENHEIM. REFLECTIONS OF POPULAR BELIEF IN GRÜNEWALD'S ALTARPIECE. Ruth Mellinkoff. California Studies in the History of Art: Discovery Series I. 1988. University of California Press, Berkeley, \$29.95.

Matthias Grünewald's altarpiece of nine panels, painted circa 1512-16, and commissioned by Abbot Guido Guersi for the high altar of the monastery and hospital of St. Anthony at Isenheim, is the subject of this beautifully illustrated and dramatic book. The hinged panels move to reveal three different views in which St. Anthony, an angelic concert with Virgin and Child, and a Crucifixion dominate. The author sets out to explain, with copious reference to illustrative and written materials, certain specific symbols in the paintings not yet satisfactorily identified and, as a consequence, hindering a true understanding of the overall theme of the altarpiece. This she presents as Christian Salvation, the victories of Christ and his saint, Anthony, over the Devil. Her book 'gives the Devil his due'.

The title of the book is apt in every way. Dr. Mellinkoff's identification of the figure of Lucifer at the back of the orchestra of angels playing to the infant Christ is crucial to her interpretation of the altarpiece — it is also compulsive and entirely convincing reading. The still young and beautiful, but corrupted and gangrenous, figure of Lucifer stands behind the good, red and gold, angels, his decaying, jewelled fingers holding a viol. He is covered in feathers, not unusual in the representations of angels around this date — the author cites a Sluter angel on *Moses Well* and another at Nuremberg. The vast array of angels in feathered jumpsuits of pink or blue or gold in East Anglian churches, on roofs and in windows, and notably on the screens at Barton Turf and Ranworth (Norfolk), could also be cited. This East Anglian fashion developed as early as 1400 but seems comparatively rare elsewhere, except for occasional use by Netherlandish artists such as Sluter and, from Dr. Mellinkoff's evidence, in Southern Germany c.1500. The fifteenth-century cult of the Orders of Angels, its origin, location and spread would be a useful and entertaining study (with a side-look at their fallen fellows). The latter are also well represented in surviving English glass and carving, in feathers or hair depending on their state of depravity — the feathers of Grünewald's Lucifer are fast becoming hair. The author seeks an example of such a transformation elsewhere — perhaps a manuscript commissioned, 1457-61, by Thomas Chaudler of Oxford almost provides one. Its 'first act' shows good angels, including feathered ones, on one side of God, while on the other side the fallen angels plunge into hell, kicking up their heels, revealing hairy backsides under their gowns. There is no precise transformation of feathers into hair but the process of uglification is well conveyed and their feathered wings are the first attribute to suffer and become bat-like. (*Chaudler Mss*, ed. M. R. James, Roxburghe Club 1916). Dr. Mellinkoff shows that Grünewald's Lucifer is crowned with the peacock's crest of pride, also worn by the serpent in the Garden of Eden, and finally explains his puzzled frown by reference to the popular belief that the Devil was deceived by Christ's humanity. He knows of the birth but fails to understand what is really going on.

All Dr. Mellinkoff's other iconographic solutions are set out with impressive erudition: the smaller demons, Ecclesia, the bathtub, cruet of oil and chamber pot.

The transforming genius of Grünewald is given much credit but one wonders how much the learning and preoccupations of the Abbot who commissioned the work contributed to the inclusion of all the elaborate symbolism in this particular panel as well as to the overall scheme. The patron may well have laid down very precise instructions and discussed and approved all details of a work so conspicuously on view in his church.

This is not a book that tells the curious everything about Grünewald or his art, it is an elaborately illustrated essay, but it whets the appetite for more. It is also a model analysis of specific points of medieval iconography.

ANNE F. SUTTON

THE CHRONICLES OF THE WARS OF THE ROSES. Edited by Elizabeth Hallam. 1988. Weidenfeld and Nicholson, London, £16.95.

This is the third volume in the 'Chronicles' series edited by Elizabeth Hallam, following *The Plantagenet Chronicles* and *Chronicles of the Age of Chivalry*, and covers the years from the accession of Richard II in 1377 to the death of Richard III in 1485. The heart of the work, like that of its predecessors, lies in translated extracts from the major English and continental chroniclers of the period, such as Thomas Walsingham, Tito Livio and Domenico Mancini, which have been spliced together to form a fairly continuous narrative of the main events in each reign. Interleaved with these are over one hundred short essays providing information on a whole range of subjects from politics to fashion, and from literature to trade and manners, which amply enlarge on the narrative and which are, in addition, richly adorned with photographs and contemporary illustrations. These have been well researched and chosen and the reproduction is of a high standard. The volume thus provides a delightful and easily accessible introduction to the sources of the period as well as to much that is interesting in the way of background material.

There are, however, some annoying faults. To begin with, none of the illustrations is identified by manuscript and repository except in a rather clumsy list at the end of the volume, nor have they been given reference numbers, so that to follow up more than one or two of them would be an unnecessarily tedious business. Reproductions of major paintings such as Van Eyck's Arnolfini Wedding have been given no provenance at all. More serious are the inaccuracies in the essays. The husband of Elizabeth Shore, for example, is described as a goldsmith when in fact he was a mercer, while Richard Whittington is reported to have left endowments to Christ's Hospital, a post-Reformation foundation. On the other hand, Whittington's own major surviving almshouse, Whittington College, is listed as a defunct institution.

Then, too, Memling's *Donne Triptych*, a work of the 1480s, is incorrectly dated to the 1460s, and the bear emblem at the feet of Richard III's queen in the portrait from the *Rous Roll* is explained as the badge of the Nevilles. It is, in fact, the emblem of the town of Warwick. There may well be other such errors and while they may not be of enormous importance — indeed, perhaps they are inevitable in a work of such breadth — they do detract somewhat from an otherwise useful and visually very pleasing volume.

ALEXANDRA SINCLAIR

Notices of Books and Articles

The following list consists of recent books and articles, mainly published in the last twelve months, although earlier publications may be included. The appearance of an item does not preclude its subsequent review. Items marked by an asterisk are in the Society's Library.

BOOKS

Francis Grewe and Margarethe de Neergaard, *Shoes and Pattens*, Museum of London, Medieval Finds from Excavations in London No. 2, 1988. 148 pages. Illustrated. Paperback £11.95.

Profusely illustrated and detailed account of all the medieval shoes found in London excavations charting the development of footwear from the twelfth to the fifteenth century.

Geoffrey Hodges, *Ludford Bridge and Mortimer's Cross. The Wars of the Roses in Herefordshire and the Welsh Marches, and the Accession of Edward IV*. Illustrated. 80 pages. 1989. Copies available from Logaston Press, Wootton, Almeley, Herefordshire HR3 6QH. £3.95 plus 45p post and packing.

The importance of these two battles to the leadership of the Yorkists and Edward's eventual claim to the throne.*

Elizabeth Salter, *English and International: Studies in the Literature, Art and Patronage of Medieval England*. Edited by Derek Pearsall and Nicolette

Zeeman. Illustrated. 377 pages. 1988. Cambridge University Press, £40.

Partly a reprint of articles on Langland, Chaucer and the relation of their work to the visual arts, this also contains a study — unfinished and limited to the twelfth and thirteenth centuries — of the cultural interaction between England and the continent, especially the foreign influence on English literature and royal taste and patronage.

Barbara A. Shailor, *The Medieval Book. Catalogue of an Exhibition at the Beinecke Rare Book and Manuscript Library, Yale University*. Illustrated. 115 pages. 1988. Yale University Library, New Haven, Connecticut.

Celebration of the Library's 25th Anniversary. Covers bindings and construction of books as well as contents, from first century A.D. to late fifteenth century. Four colour plates and extensive black and white illustrations.

Three Chronicles of the Reign of Edward IV, with an introduction by Keith Dockray. 1989. Alan Sutton Publishing Ltd., Gloucester, £17.

Re-issue of *The Arrivall*, Warkworth's *Chronicle*, *The Chronicle of the Rebellion in Lincolnshire, 1470*. Not a new edition; brief, new introduction.

Christopher Tyerman, *England and the Crusades, 1095-1588*. 504 pages. Illustrated. 1988. Chicago University Press, £24.95.

A history of the political and economic impact of the crusades and crusading values on English society and of England's contribution to their finances and manpower.

ARTICLES

Nigel H. Bramwell and Roger W. Byard, The Bones in the Abbey: Are they the Murdered Princes? A Review of the Evidence, *The American Journal of Forensic Medicine and Pathology*, volume 10, number 1 (1989), pages 83-87.

Summarizes the findings of the Tanner and Wright report on the exhumation of the Bones in 1933, pointing out inaccuracies and omissions, and reviews improved techniques for carbon dating and other scientific tests which would enable a more accurate analysis of the age, gender and consanguinity of the Bones to be made if they could be re-examined now.*

Hilary M. Carey, Devout Literate Laypeople and the Pursuit of the Mixed Life in Later Medieval England, *Journal of Religious History*, volume 14, number 4, 1987, pages 361-81.

Enumerates and puts in their context religious vernacular books available to laymen, and especially laywomen, in the fifteenth century, to illustrate the change to a more personal and intense devotion after circa 1400.

Alexandra F. Johnston, Chaucer's Records of Early English Drama, *Records of Early English Drama*, volume 13, number 2, 1988, pages 13-20.

Brief summary of evidence for the practice of civic drama in the fourteenth century including that in Chaucer's works.

Michael K. Jones, Somerset, York and the Wars of the Roses, *The English Historical Review*, volume 14, number 411, April 1989, pages 285-307.

Discussion of the development of the enmity between Richard, Duke of York, and Edmund, Duke of Somerset, 1445-52, particularly its chivalric aspect brought to the fore by Somerset's 'dishonourable' surrender of Rouen.*

Martin Lowry, John Rous and the Survival of the Neville Circle, *Viator*, volume 19, 1988, pages 327-338.

On Rous, the antiquary, as a member of the 'intellectual' circle within the Neville affinity. States that the function of the Rous Roll was to excite sympathy for the Kingmaker's widow.*

Philippa Maddern, Honour among the Pastons: Gender and Integrity in fifteenth-century English Provincial Society, *Journal of Medieval History*, volume 14, 1988, pages 357-371.

A wider interpretation of honour outside the limited world of chivalry and war. Relationships with tenants, clients and fellow magistrates are seen as part of a more peaceful honour in which women could also share. The developing rôle of private conscience is considered.*

Marjorie K. McIntosh, Money Lending on the Periphery of London, 1300-1600, *Albion*, volume 20, number 4, Winter 1988, pages 557-571.

The study centres on the well documented royal demesne manor of Havering and charts the rôle and extent of money lending, the kind of people involved, the form of the loans and the changes 1300 to 1600. A thoroughly commercialised area providing consumer goods to London by 1300. The most significant development is found between 1460 and 1560.

Jacqueline Murray, Kinship and Friendship: The Perception of Family by Clergy and Laity in Late Medieval London, *Albion*, volume 20, number 3, Fall 1988, pages 369-85.

Study of London Consistory Court wills, 1514-48, revealing bonds of friendship — especially of the unmarried including the clergy — and family affection among people otherwise 'unknown to history'.

Kathleen Scott, *Caveat Lector*: Ownership and Standardization in the Illustration of Fifteenth-Century English Manuscripts, in *English Manuscript Studies 1100-1700*, volume 1, edited by Peter Beal and Jeremy Griffiths, Basil Blackwell, Oxford, 1989, pages 19-63.

The changes that the demands of the original owners of manuscripts made, or inflicted, on the usual pictorial matter, iconography and decoration of the texts. These effects are entitled: displacement, distortion, expansion or contraction. Pictures of patrons and of coats of arms are the two marks of ownership dealt with.

J. A. F. Thomson, Orthodox Religion and the Origins of Lollardy, *History*, volume 74, number 240, February 1989, pages 39-55.

Wyclif's influence on non-academic and later followers was partial and varied. 'Lollard', at first little more than a nickname, came to mean heretic only when the distinction between orthodoxy and heresy had to be defined by the authorities in their investigation of suspected cases.

Roger Virgoe, The Benevolence of 1481, *English Historical Review*, volume 104, number 410, January 1989, pages 25-45.

Edward IV's second benevolence taken to help pay for the Scots campaign of 1481, which never took place; some of the money was probably used to pay for Gloucester's campaign of 1482. About £30,000 collected. Efficient and unpopular. Local and Exchequer records contribute to an unusually good picture of the collection of this tax and include two books of the tax collectors in Norfolk.*

Notes on Contributors

Michael Bennett. Author of *Community, Class and Careerism. Cheshire and Lancashire Society in the Age of 'Sir Gawain and the Green Knight', The Battle of Bosworth and Lambert Simnel and the Battle of Stoke.*

Julia Boffey. Lecturer in the English Department, Queen Mary College; author of *The Manuscripts of English Courtly Love Lyrics in the Later Middle Ages*; works on fifteenth-century literature and book production.

Bruce Campbell is an economic historian whose prime research interest is the agrarian economy of medieval England. He is currently completing a book on *The Geography of Seigneurial Agriculture in Medieval England.*

Margaret Condon is a graduate of Bristol. Currently working on an edition of the letters of Reynold Bray, receiver general of Margaret Beaufort and one of the chief councillors of Henry VII.

Richard Du Cann. Born 1929 in Gray's Inn and interested in the law ever since. Began writing *The Art of the Advocate* to keep himself during the usual slow start at the Bar.

Carole Rawcliffe. Co-editor of the forthcoming 1386-1422 volumes of *The History of Parliament*. Author of *The Staffords, Earls of Stafford and Dukes of Buckingham* (1978) and several articles on fifteenth-century history.

Alexandra Sinclair completed a thesis on the Beauchamp Earls of Warwick in 1986. Has written on the Berkeley dispute and is now preparing a new edition of the *Beauchamp Pageant*.

Jenny Stratford, a former Assistant Keeper, Department of Manuscripts, British Museum. Compiler of a Catalogue of Manuscript Fragments in the Royal Library, Windsor; working on an edition of the inventories of John, Duke of Bedford.

J. A. F. Thomson. Reader in Mediaeval History, University of Glasgow. Currently working on the early Tudor Church. Author of articles on the Yorkist period, and a text-book on the later middle ages, *The Transformation of Mediaeval England* (1983).

Livia Visser-Fuchs is working on the literary background and propaganda of Anglo-Burgundian relations of the Yorkist period.

Contributions to the Ricardian

These are welcomed on any subject relevant to the aims of the Society. These may be illustrated by photographs (glossy prints showing good contrast) or by line drawings. All contributions, including letters, must be typewritten, with double spacing and adequate margins, on one side of the paper only. Permission must be obtained for the use of copyright material, but this is not usually necessary for short quotes. References and footnotes must be given in one sequence at the end of the article. Details need not be given in full for second and subsequent references to the same source. They must take the form of the following examples:

R. Horrox and P. W. Hammond (eds.), *British Library Manuscript 433* (4 vols. Upminster and London 1979-83), vol. 1, pp.45-6.

Daniel Williams, The hastily drawn up will of William Catesby Esquire, 25 August 1485, *Leicestershire Archaeological and Historical Society Transactions*, vol. 51 (1975-6), p.48.

Anyone interested in taking display advertisement space—full, half or quarter page—or in placing an insert should contact the Editor. (Classified advertisements should be sent to the Editor of the Bulletin).

Contributions for the December 1989 *Ricardian* must reach Miss Anne Sutton, 17 Enfield Cloisters, Fanshaw Street, London N1 6LD, by September 30. Articles should be sent well in advance. Further advice on presentation may be obtained from the Editor.

RICHARD III AND YORKIST HISTORY TRUST

The Crowland Chronicle Continuations: 1459-1486

Edited Nicholas Pronay and John Cox

The second and third continuations, in parallel Latin and English texts, with an introduction discussing the authorship of the second continuation, its date of composition and historiography.

210 pages. Illustrated.

Special price to Members of the Richard III Society £15, including p&p, from Miss A. Smith, 14 Lincoln Road, Guildford, Surrey GU2 6TJ.

Cheques to be payable to Richard III Society.

£25, including p&p to Non-Members, from Alan Sutton Publishing Ltd., 30 Brunswick Road, Gloucester GL1 1HG. Cheques to be payable to Alan Sutton Publishing Ltd.

Richard III: Loyalty, Lordship and Law

Edited: P. W. Hammond

Papers of the second Richard III Society Symposium, April 1984, with introduction.

Anne Crawford: The Private Life of John Howard: A Study of a Yorkist Lord, his Family and Household.

Michael K. Jones: Richard III and Lady Margaret Beaufort: A Re-assessment.

Keith Dockray: Richard III and the Yorkist Gentry, c.1471-1485.

Anne F. Sutton: 'A Curious Searcher for our Weal Public': Richard III, Piety, Chivalry, and the Concept of the Good Prince.

R. H. Helmholz: The Sons of Edward IV: A Canonical Assessment of the Claims that they were Illegitimate.

P. W. Hammond and W. J. White: The Sons of Edward IV: A Re-examination of the Evidence on their Deaths and on the Bones in Westminster Abbey.

Norman Macdougall: Richard III and James III: Contemporary Monarchs, Parallel Mythologies.

Colin Richmond: 1485 and All That, or what was going on at the Battle of Bosworth?

190 pages.

Special price to Members of Richard III Society £10, including p&p. Price to Non-Members £15, including p&p. Details of addresses as above.